1 3.1 AESTHETICS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AESTHETICS – Would the Project:</th>
<th>Potentially Significant Impact</th>
<th>Less Than Significant with Mitigation</th>
<th>Less Than Significant Impact</th>
<th>No Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Have a substantial adverse effect on a scenic vista?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Substantially damage scenic resources, including, but not limited to, trees, rock outcroppings, and historic buildings within a state scenic highway?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td>☒</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Substantially degrade the existing visual character or quality of the site and its surroundings?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Create a new source of substantial light or glare which would adversely affect day or nighttime views in the area?</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☒</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☒</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2 3.1.1 Environmental Setting

The Encina Marine Oil Terminal (MOT) is fronted by Carlsbad State Beach and Carlsbad Boulevard. Carlsbad State Beach is a popular area for surfing, swimming, skin diving, fishing, picnicking, and other recreational activities. Beach and ocean resource use is greatest within the Project vicinity in summer and during weekends; however, the beach area, associated undesignated bluff trails, and designated bike lane, which is located (striped) on the ocean side of Carlsbad Boulevard, are well utilized by walkers, joggers, and/or bicyclists year-round.

Carlsbad Boulevard is a popular beach access route and is identified as a Scenic Route in the Agua Hedionda Land Use Plan (City of Carlsbad 2010b) and a Community Theme Corridor in the City of Carlsbad (2013b) General Plan Circulation Element. The Interstate-5 (I-5) transportation corridor, located to the east of the Encina Power Station (EPS), is an Eligible State Scenic Highway and is considered a Community Scenic Corridor by the City of Carlsbad.

The Encina MOT fuel oil submarine pipeline extends from the onshore EPS facility to its offshore termination and is covered on Carlsbad State Beach with riprap that extends into the surf zone (see foreground of Figure 3.1-1 A and Figure 3.1-1 B). South of the riprap groin, a wall extends along the beach (in front of the EPS) to a bluff south of the site. Approximately 300 feet north of the riprap groin are two sets of riprap rock jetties (intake and outfall channels) associated with Agua Hedionda Lagoon. The pipeline crosses Carlsbad Boulevard below ground and is accessed via a beach valve pit located within the EPS. Views of the beach valve pit from Carlsbad Boulevard are partially blocked by perimeter fencing at the EPS (see Figure 3.1-2).
A. Existing View from Onshore Fuel Oil Submarine Pipeline Corridor Looking South

B. Existing View Looking North at Onshore Fuel Oil Submarine Pipeline Corridor

Figure 3.1-1. Beach Views Looking South and North
A. Existing View from Beach at Carlsbad Boulevard Looking East

B. Existing View from Carlsbad Boulevard Looking Northeast

Figure 3.1-2. Views from Carlsbad Boulevard Looking East
3.1.2 Regulatory Setting

3.1.2.1 Federal and State

Federal and State laws and regulations pertaining to this issue area and relevant to the Project are identified in Table 3.1-1.

Table 3.1-1. Laws, Regulations, and Policies (Aesthetics)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>U.S.</th>
<th>CZMA (see Table 1.2).</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CA</td>
<td>California Scenic Highway Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CA</td>
<td>Coastal Act Chapter 3 policies (see also Table 1-2)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.1.2.2 Local

The City of Carlsbad (2006) General Plan Open Space and Conservation Element (OSCE) contains the following aesthetics-related goal, objective, and policy relevant to onshore Project activities.

- Goal A.4: A city that preserves as open space, hillsides, ridges, valleys, canyons, lagoons, beaches and other unique resources that provide visual and physical relief to the Cityscape.

- Objective B.7: To minimize impacts from new development on hillsides, ridges, valleys, canyons, lagoons, beaches and other unique resources that provide visual and physical relief to the cityscape.

- Policy C.1: Utilize sensitive design criteria to preserve the unique and special resources in the City and to integrate them into the design of any development.

The General Plan Parks and Recreation Element (City of Carlsbad 2003) includes the following special resource, open space, and cultural historical areas goal relevant to onshore Project activities:

- Goal A.3: A City that preserves areas of scenic, historic, and cultural value.
3.1.3 Impact Analysis

a) Have a substantial adverse effect on a scenic vista?

Less than Significant with Mitigation. The presence of onshore and offshore vessels and equipment at the Project site would result in short-term aesthetic impacts to views of the beach and ocean. Project operations would be visible to people: (1) on Carlsbad Boulevard, other local streets, and possibly I-5 and the railroad corridor; (2) recreating on the beach; (3) engaging in ocean activities (e.g., recreational boating); and (4) at ocean-view homes in the area. Views of offshore vessels, which would be needed for decommissioning activities, are not entirely incongruent with typical ocean views, and the site was historically used for fuel transfers, with large vessels mooring at the MOT and vessels and equipment located offshore during periodic maintenance of the MOT.

Offshore and surf zone work would include two barges, two tug boats, and two crew boats. Work in the surf zone would also require the use of onshore equipment, including two excavators, one bulldozer, one front-end loader, one crawler crane, and smaller miscellaneous equipment. Similar equipment would also be used for work in the beach and onshore segments. All equipment would be visible to the public during decommissioning. Offshore equipment would be on-site for about 7 months (3 months for the surf zone segment and 4 months for the offshore segment). Equipment operating on the beach, which would be used for portions of the onshore, beach, and surf zone segments, would be in service over a period of about 5 months, although not continuously. Onshore equipment operations east of Carlsbad Boulevard are expected to occur over 3 months; however, not all of the equipment would be in operation during this period and, unlike the beach and ocean, the area east of Carlsbad Boulevard is not considered a scenic vista (see Table A1-1 in Appendix A).

In order to minimize the number of viewers affected by the Project, the present decommissioning schedule avoids work during the summer (Memorial Day through Labor Day). Additionally, a 5-day work week was identified in the Project Description to avoid work on weekends when more people would be expected to use the beach.

To ensure that Project activities avoid the peak beach and ocean use periods, the Applicant shall implement MM AES-1 to minimize the Project’s aesthetic impact in the area to less than significant.

MM AES-1: Project Scheduling. Onshore Project decommissioning shall be conducted outside of the peak public beach/ocean-use periods (summer [May 31 to September 5] and weekends) in order to minimize the number of viewers affected by the Project to the extent feasible. Exceptions allowing weekend work may occur in certain limited cases such as when work requires an extreme low tide that only occurs on a weekend.
b) **Substantially damage scenic resources, including, but not limited to, trees, rock outcroppings, and historic buildings within a state scenic highway?**

No Impact. I-5, located east of the EPS, is an eligible, State scenic highway; however, it has not been officially designated as such. As a result, the Project would not substantially damage scenic resources, including trees, rock outcroppings, and historic buildings, within a State scenic highway; therefore, there would be no impact.

c) **Substantially degrade the existing visual character or quality of the site and its surroundings?**

Less than Significant with Mitigation. As discussed in a) above, the Project would temporarily introduce construction materials, equipment, vessels and activities to the Project area. This would be considered a short-term degradation of the visual character of the beach and ocean area subject to Project activities. MM AES-1 would serve to mitigate this impact. Additionally, the subsurface fuel oil submarine pipeline and other facilities would be decommissioned in a manner that would not degrade the existing visual character of the site or surroundings. Therefore, with the implementation of MM AES-1, the potential impacts of the Project on the existing visual character or quality of the site and its surroundings would be reduced to less than significant.

d) **Create a new source of substantial light or glare which would adversely affect day or nighttime views in the area?**

Less than Significant with Mitigation. No long-term sources of light, glare, or nighttime lighting would be introduced by the Project; however, 24-hour operations may occur to maintain the Project schedule, which would require the use of diesel-driven light plants. As a result, nighttime operations may cause temporary adverse lighting impacts to nearby residents. To reduce potential impacts caused by Project lighting, the Applicant shall implement MM AES-2 to minimize substantial light and glare and ensure potential impacts to day or nighttime views in the area are less than significant.

**MM AES-2: Night-Lighting Spillage Minimization.** Night-lighting required for Project decommissioning activities shall be shielded and directed to the immediate work area to avoid light spillage onto private property.

3.1.4 Mitigation Summary

Implementation of the following mitigation measures would reduce the potential for Project-related impacts to aesthetics to less than significant.

- **MM AES-1: Project Scheduling.**
- **MM AES-2: Night-Lighting Spillage Minimization.**