

1 **3.1 AESTHETICS**

AESTHETICS – Would the Project:	Potentially Significant Impact	Less Than Significant with Mitigation	Less Than Significant Impact	No Impact
a) Have a substantial adverse effect on a scenic vista?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
b) Substantially damage scenic resources, including, but not limited to, trees, rock outcroppings, and historic buildings within a state scenic highway?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
c) Substantially degrade the existing visual character or quality of the site and its surroundings?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
d) Create a new source of substantial light or glare which would adversely affect day or nighttime views in the area?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

2 **3.1.1 Environmental Setting**

3 The Encina Marine Oil Terminal (MOT) is fronted by Carlsbad State Beach and
 4 Carlsbad Boulevard. Carlsbad State Beach is a popular area for surfing, swimming, skin
 5 diving, fishing, picnicking, and other recreational activities. Beach and ocean resource
 6 use is greatest within the Project vicinity in summer and during weekends; however, the
 7 beach area, associated undesignated bluff trails, and designated bike lane, which is
 8 located (striped) on the ocean side of Carlsbad Boulevard, are well utilized by walkers,
 9 joggers, and/or bicyclists year-round.

10 Carlsbad Boulevard is a popular beach access route and is identified as a Scenic Route
 11 in the Agua Hedionda Land Use Plan (City of Carlsbad 2010b) and a Community
 12 Theme Corridor in the City of Carlsbad (2013b) General Plan Circulation Element. The
 13 Interstate-5 (I-5) transportation corridor, located to the east of the Encina Power Station
 14 (EPS), is an Eligible State Scenic Highway and is considered a Community Scenic
 15 Corridor by the City of Carlsbad.

16 The Encina MOT fuel oil submarine pipeline extends from the onshore EPS facility to its
 17 offshore termination and is covered on Carlsbad State Beach with riprap that extends
 18 into the surf zone (see foreground of Figure 3.1-1 A and Figure 3.1-1 B). South of the
 19 riprap groin, a wall extends along the beach (in front of the EPS) to a bluff south of the
 20 site. Approximately 300 feet north of the riprap groin are two sets of riprap rock jetties
 21 (intake and outfall channels) associated with Agua Hedionda Lagoon. The pipeline
 22 crosses Carlsbad Boulevard below ground and is accessed via a beach valve pit
 23 located within the EPS. Views of the beach valve pit from Carlsbad Boulevard are
 24 partially blocked by perimeter fencing at the EPS (see Figure 3.1-2).

**A. Existing View
from Onshore
Fuel Oil
Submarine
Pipeline Corridor
Looking South**



**B. Existing View
Looking North at
Onshore Fuel Oil
Submarine
Pipeline Corridor**



Figure 3.1-1. Beach Views Looking South and North

**A. Existing View
from Beach at
Carlsbad
Boulevard
Looking East**



**B. Existing View
from Carlsbad
Boulevard
Looking
Northeast**



Figure 3.1-2. Views from Carlsbad Boulevard Looking East

1 **3.1.2 Regulatory Setting**

2 3.1.2.1 Federal and State

3 Federal and State laws and regulations pertaining to this issue area and relevant to the
 4 Project are identified in Table 3.1-1.

Table 3.1-1. Laws, Regulations, and Policies (Aesthetics)

U.S.	CZMA (see Table 1.2).	
CA	California Scenic Highway Program	The California Scenic Highway Program, managed by the California Department of Transportation, was created to preserve and protect scenic highway corridors from change that would diminish the aesthetic value of lands adjacent to highways. State highways identified as scenic, or eligible for designation, are listed in California Streets and Highways Code section 260 et seq.
CA	Coastal Act Chapter 3 policies (see also Table 1-2)	The Coastal Act is concerned with protecting the public viewshed, including views from public areas, such as roads, beaches, coastal trails, and access ways. Section 30251 states: "Permitted development shall be sited and designed to protect views to and along the ocean and scenic coastal areas, to minimize the alteration of natural landforms, to be visually compatible with the character of the surrounding area, and, where feasible, to restore and enhance visual quality in visually degraded areas."

5 3.1.2.2 Local

6 The City of Carlsbad (2006) General Plan Open Space and Conservation Element
 7 (OSCE) contains the following aesthetics-related goal, objective, and policy relevant to
 8 onshore Project activities.

- 9 • Goal A.4: A city that preserves as open space, hillsides, ridges, valleys, canyons,
 10 lagoons, beaches and other unique resources that provide visual and physical
 11 relief to the Cityscape.
- 12 • Objective B.7: To minimize impacts from new development on hillsides, ridges,
 13 valleys, canyons, lagoons, beaches and other unique resources that provide
 14 visual and physical relief to the cityscape.
- 15 • Policy C.1: Utilize sensitive design criteria to preserve the unique and special
 16 resources in the City and to integrate them into the design of any development.

17 The General Plan Parks and Recreation Element (City of Carlsbad 2003) includes the
 18 following special resource, open space, and cultural historical areas goal relevant to
 19 onshore Project activities:

- 20 • Goal A.3: A City that preserves areas of scenic, historic, and cultural value.

1 **3.1.3 Impact Analysis**

2 **a) Have a substantial adverse effect on a scenic vista?**

3 **Less than Significant with Mitigation.** The presence of onshore and offshore vessels
4 and equipment at the Project site would result in short-term aesthetic impacts to views
5 of the beach and ocean. Project operations would be visible to people: (1) on Carlsbad
6 Boulevard, other local streets, and possibly I-5 and the railroad corridor; (2) recreating
7 on the beach; (3) engaging in ocean activities (e.g., recreational boating); and (4) at
8 ocean-view homes in the area. Views of offshore vessels, which would be needed for
9 decommissioning activities, are not entirely incongruent with typical ocean views, and
10 the site was historically used for fuel transfers, with large vessels mooring at the MOT
11 and vessels and equipment located offshore during periodic maintenance of the MOT.

12 Offshore and surf zone work would include two barges, two tug boats, and two crew
13 boats. Work in the surf zone would also require the use of onshore equipment, including
14 two excavators, one bulldozer, one front-end loader, one crawler crane, and smaller
15 miscellaneous equipment. Similar equipment would also be used for work in the beach
16 and onshore segments. All equipment would be visible to the public during
17 decommissioning. Offshore equipment would be on-site for about 7 months (3 months
18 for the surf zone segment and 4 months for the offshore segment). Equipment operating
19 on the beach, which would be used for portions of the onshore, beach, and surf zone
20 segments, would be in service over a period of about 5 months, although not
21 continuously. Onshore equipment operations east of Carlsbad Boulevard are expected
22 to occur over 3 months; however, not all of the equipment would be in operation during
23 this period and, unlike the beach and ocean, the area east of Carlsbad Boulevard is not
24 considered a scenic vista (see Table A1-1 in Appendix A).

25 In order to minimize the number of viewers affected by the Project, the present
26 decommissioning schedule avoids work during the summer (Memorial Day through
27 Labor Day). Additionally, a 5-day work week was identified in the Project Description to
28 avoid work on weekends when more people would be expected to use the beach.

29 To ensure that Project activities avoid the peak beach and ocean use periods, the
30 Applicant shall implement MM AES-1 to minimize the Project's aesthetic impact in the
31 area to less than significant.

32 **MM AES-1: Project Scheduling.** Onshore Project decommissioning shall be
33 conducted outside of the peak public beach/ocean-use periods (summer [May 31
34 to September 5] and weekends) in order to minimize the number of viewers
35 affected by the Project to the extent feasible. Exceptions allowing weekend work
36 may occur in certain limited cases such as when work requires an extreme low
37 tide that only occurs on a weekend.

1 **b) Substantially damage scenic resources, including, but not limited to, trees,**
2 **rock outcroppings, and historic buildings within a state scenic highway?**

3 **No Impact.** I-5, located east of the EPS, is an eligible, State scenic highway; however, it
4 has not been officially designated as such. As a result, the Project would not
5 substantially damage scenic resources, including trees, rock outcroppings, and historic
6 buildings, within a State scenic highway; therefore, there would be no impact.

7 **c) Substantially degrade the existing visual character or quality of the site and its**
8 **surroundings?**

9 **Less than Significant with Mitigation.** As discussed in **a)** above, the Project would
10 temporarily introduce construction materials, equipment, vessels and activities to the
11 Project area. This would be considered a short-term degradation of the visual character
12 of the beach and ocean area subject to Project activities. **MM AES-1** would serve to
13 mitigate this impact. Additionally, the subsurface fuel oil submarine pipeline and other
14 facilities would be decommissioned in a manner that would not degrade the existing
15 visual character of the site or surroundings. Therefore, with the implementation of **MM**
16 **AES-1**, the potential impacts of the Project on the existing visual character or quality of
17 the site and its surroundings would be reduced to less than significant.

18 **d) Create a new source of substantial light or glare which would adversely affect**
19 **day or nighttime views in the area?**

20 **Less than Significant with Mitigation.** No long-term sources of light, glare, or
21 nighttime lighting would be introduced by the Project; however, 24-hour operations may
22 occur to maintain the Project schedule, which would require the use of diesel-driven
23 light plants. As a result, nighttime operations may cause temporary adverse lighting
24 impacts to nearby residents. To reduce potential impacts caused by Project lighting, the
25 Applicant shall implement MM AES-2 to minimize substantial light and glare and ensure
26 potential impacts to day or nighttime views in the area are less than significant.

27 **MM AES-2: Night-Lighting Spillage Minimization.** Night-lighting required for
28 Project decommissioning activities shall be shielded and directed to the
29 immediate work area to avoid light spillage onto private property.

30 **3.1.4 Mitigation Summary**

31 Implementation of the following mitigation measures would reduce the potential for
32 Project-related impacts to aesthetics to less than significant.

- 33 • MM AES-1: Project Scheduling.
- 34 • MM AES-2: Night-Lighting Spillage Minimization.